



Armstrong, Paul F.

Working Paper
The Heatherton Inheritance

Working Paper No. 2017-01
Revision 18 April, 2017

Suggested Citation:

Armstrong, Paul F. (2017). The Heatherton Inheritance. MIRCS Institute, Working Paper No. 2017-01, Halifax, Canada.

This Version is available at:

http://www.mircs.ca/education/working_papers/



Terms of use:

MIRCS Institute grants you, the user, the non-exclusive right to use the selected work free of charge, territorially unrestricted, on the following terms: attribution, non-commercial, no derivatives, as described at <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

MIRCS Institute

P. O. Box 8041

Halifax, N.S. B3K 5L8

www.mircs.ca

The Heatherton Inheritance

Paul F. Armstrong
Working Paper No. 2017-01

Version: April 18, 2017

In this paper, my aim is to link the larger Catholic political framework discussed in an earlier paper to the Scottish culture of Antigonish.¹ I do so through the use of an ideal-type, the ‘representative individual’.

Alfred Marshall introduced the concept of the ‘representative firm’ in 1891 in an effort to go beyond statistical averages, later developed by other economists as the ‘representative agent’: “Marshall recommended intensive study of few ‘carefully chosen’ cases rather than ‘the extensive method of collecting [...] very numerous observations [...] obtaining broad averages in which inaccuracies and idiosyncrasies may be trusted to counteract one another to some extent” (Marshall, quoted in Dardi, 2005). The justified criticism of the concept, first raised by Lionel Robbins was that “it cloaks the essential heterogeneity of productive factors” (Robbins, 1928: 399).

However, it is not heterogeneity all the way down, but only that which is causally salient. Each ideal-type is analytically relevant, therefore, only at some particular level of contextuality, varying systematically from local to universal applications. The ideal-type of the “representative individual” is, I want to claim, a meso-level concept, still contextually particular, but with some application across different communities. Here I provide background for a regional model of Scottish Catholic culture in

¹ I use the word “Antigonish” here, and generally throughout the chapter, to refer to the region of Eastern Nova Scotia. It is synonymous with the present Diocese of Antigonish, consisting of Cape Breton Island, and the Counties of Antigonish, Guysborough, and Pictou. In the early years, however, the diocesan name and boundaries varied, as did county names. The word is being used, therefore, as a generic term for a region, rather than as a reference to the town of Antigonish.

late nineteenth century Nova Scotia by assembling a portrait of the life and circumstances of D. J. MacDonald, a “representative individual” of the Antigonish Movement.

Let me begin with a sketch of Father MacDonald and a preliminary sketch of his role in the Antigonish Movement.² Born to John B. and Flora MacDonald in Glassburn (Immaculate Conception Parish), near the village of Heatherton, some 10 miles east of Antigonish, Daniel Joseph MacDonald (1881-1948) took his Bachelor of Arts degree at St. Francis Xavier University (St.F.X.), graduating in 1900, and followed this with theological studies in Rome at Urban College. He was ordained as a priest by Cardinal Respighi in 1904, and returned to Nova Scotia to serve in parish life. In 1910, he entered the Catholic University of America in Washington to do graduate work in social science. He received his Master’s degree in 1911 and his Ph.D. in 1912. Upon his return to Antigonish diocese, he was appointed as Professor of Economics and Sociology at St. F.X.,³ in which position he continued until his retirement in 1944. He took on additional responsibilities, first as Vice-Rector from 1925 to 1930, then as Vice-President from 1930 to 1936, and finally as President from 1936 to 1944. As the Antigonish Movement was led and administered by St.F.X., MacDonald’s responsibilities properly make him the “banker” of the Movement. He died in 1948 and was buried in the local parish cemetery in Heatherton near the home where he had been born.⁴

I want to turn now to what I will call the ‘Heatherton Inheritance’, the Gaelic Catholic culture in which D.J. was raised. In the following sections, I outline three aspects of the inheritance of D.J. MacDonald: a family lineage and identity shaped by the history and practices of Scots Highland Catholicism; the Antigonish clerical regime into which he was born; and the religious sensibility of the Heatherton community.

² This discussion draws on my master’s thesis (Dalhousie University, 2010).

³ In his first year at St.F.X., he taught English and History, but thereafter taught Economics and Sociology. There was a brief period in the 1920s when another faculty member taught Sociology, and further appointments in both Economics and Sociology were made again after his appointment as President in 1936.

⁴ Sources for the biographical material include Johnston (1994), his obituary in *The Casket* newspaper for Sept. 16, 1948, and the University Calendars for 1912/13 to 1944/45.

Clan Donald Catholics

In the early medieval period, the Gaidhealtachd⁵ – the dominion of the Gaels – encompassed large swaths of territory in what is now Scotland and Ireland (Snow, 2001). In the broad scheme, the cultural separation of the Irish and Scots Gaels began with the incursions of the Norsemen down through the northern lands and the western isles and coast, and the Angles, on the other side, up the south and east coast of the Scots Gaelic territory.

In the case of the great movement up from the south, it led naturally to a cultural penetration, an anglicization of language and social practices, in the southern and eastern regions of the Gaelic territory and a gradual replacement of clan organization and land holdings with a feudal order. By the mid-sixteenth century, concerns about France's intentions for Scottish welfare, weakness in the Catholic response to Protestant insurgents, and a capable revolutionary leadership, constituted conditions leading to a radical shift in the social imaginary of the southern Scottish elites:

In early 1559 Protestants were an outlawed minority in a Catholic and pro-French state. In less than eighteen months, they won a civil war, created a new Protestant and pro-English establishment, and outlawed the practice of Catholicism in turn (Ryrie, 2006: 196).⁶

The result was that Catholicism was pushed back from the cultural and economic centres of Scottish life in the south. It remained stubbornly rooted, most particularly, however, among the Catholic clans of the Highlands – Gordon, Stewart, Chisholm, Fraser, MacDonald, and Cameron – and was highly correlated with the religious position of the Clan Chief (Smith, 2007: 4).

⁵ Gaeldom is a linguistic and cultural concept referring to a 'people', rather than a territorial state. In the mid-sixteenth century, the Scottish Gaidhealtachd was concentrated in the Highlands and Western Isles. There was a parallel Irish Gaeltacht, and the long-standing English hostility toward this people was, in part, the threat of "a consolidated Gaelic kingdom spanning the North Channel" (Ellis, 1999: 453).

⁶ It should also be noted that some of the same factors led to the conceptual division of Scotland into Highlanders and Lowlanders, a matter about which Jane Dawson (1998) has written incisively.

In the case of the southward movement of the Norsemen, there was a similar cultural penetration with the union of the Gaelic and Viking regimes under Somerled,⁷ but one in which the kinship and clan systems of governance were compatible and the Gaelic language and Christian faith could be maintained. The “most powerful of the Gaelic clans”, Clan Donald,⁸ developed from this founding of the ‘Lordship of the Isles’ and the begetting of the Somerled line, eventually to include many branches, of whom the most important for our purposes is Clan MacDonald of Clanranald. There were repeated struggles with the crown over territorial sovereignty until 1493, when, as what now seems to be the result of an overextension of MacDonald power into the territory of Clan Ross (MacDougall, 2000), the MacDonald clan suffered decisive setbacks resulting in the forfeiture of the Lord’s estates and title.

In the eyes of central government, it [the Lordship of the Isles] became a crown possession after the final forfeiture in 1493, but not until 1545, with the death of Donald Dubh, great great grandson of Donald, did the inhabitants thereof finally accept the crown as their immediate superior (Bannerman, 1977: 212).

Accepting the crown, of course, is one thing, while abandoning all interests and influence, quite another. Alison Cathcart notes the difference:

Unquestionably the lordship came to an end with the 1493 forfeiture and while genuine efforts to restore it were doomed, this does not mean the MacDonalds, as a force in the West, were finished. The clan was divided by policy and weakened by internal dissent, but Clan Donald influence in the west continued (Cathcart, 2014: 269).

⁷ “The early leaders of Clann Somhairle saw themselves as competitors for the kingship of the Isles on the basis of their descent through their mother Ragnhilt [Consort of Somerled] from her father Amlaib Derg, king of the Isles, circa 1113-54. The claim of Clann Somhairle to royal status was based on its position as a segment of Uí Ímair, the dynasty which had ruled Dublin, the Isles and Northumbria for much of the tenth century but which by the late twelfth century was confined to the Isles” (Woolf, 2005: 211).

⁸ “Most powerful” at least before the post-Reformation rise of the Campbells, who had quite early aligned themselves with the Scottish crown and Protestantism. “That the acceptance of the new religion favoured particular kin groups is evidenced by the meteoric rise of the Campbells in Argyll, Forbes and Frasers in the north-east” (Spurlock, 2013: 236).

State formation was further propelled forward with the union of the crowns in 1603, and the effort to implement a unitary conception of sovereignty throughout all the various territories (Spurlock, 2013: 235). Considerable efforts were then expended to consolidate the Scottish Kingdom:

The major motive for this assault on the Gaidhealtachdan was political: the governments of Elizabeth I in Ireland and James VI in Scotland both pursued policies of reducing the native Gaelic lordships in order to bring these largely autonomous communities under central control (Macdonald, 2006: 2).

Among other actions to that end, an assembly of Clan chiefs of the Western Isles was convened in 1609 by Andrew Knox, Bishop of the Isles in the Church of Scotland, on the instructions of James VI “to reduce that rude people to some order and acknowledgment of our authority” (quoted in MacLean, 1952: 6), and use “all kynd of hostilitie yf thay continew rebellious and dissobedyent” (quoted in Cathcart, 2010: 26). The purpose of the assembly was to negotiate an agreement, now known as the ‘Statutes of Iona’, which provided, among other things, for the education of chiefs’ heirs in Lowland schools, formal acceptance of the Protestant religion, and restrictions on various cultural aspects of Gaelic society. “Since their [the Islemens’] alternatives were to be forced from their land by the earl of Argyll, who had received a commission to extirpate the Clan Donald, or to see their patrimonial lands planted like Lewis or Ulster, the Highland elite were amenable and open to negotiation with Knox” (Cathcart, 2010: 26).

The consolidation of the Scottish state and the inward turning of the Scottish Gaels was paralleled by an inward turn of the Irish Gaels. Jane Dawson indicates that there was a rather broad social causation which led to this separation: “growing Scottish self-confidence”, found in arts and crafts production and, I would add scholarship, under the ‘Lordship of the Isles’; linguistic divergence in which “the spoken languages of the Gaels within Ireland and Scotland also grew apart”; distinct Scottish literary forms which emerged, where “two of the important Scottish developments, the waulking songs and strophic verse, were not exported to Ireland”; musical evolution, such that “in the Gaidhealtachd of Scotland the harp was gradually replaced by the bagpipe”; structural

political differences which saw the “ruthless destruction of their [the Gaelic chiefs] influence in Ireland, but, within Scotland, an attempt to incorporate them into national politics”; and, finally, the development of religious differences where the Irish resistance to colonization led to “a shared commitment to the Catholic cause”, unlike Scotland where political union with England provided “Gaelic Calvinism” with traction among some Highland clans. “By the end of the early modern period separate and distinctive Scottish and Irish identities had emerged within the Gaelic world” (Dawson, 1998: 259; 262-267). As Fiona Macdonald has summarized:

Politically, this period [from the sixteenth to the eighteenth century] marked a transition from fairly autonomous Gaelic units – lordships and clans with distinct social and economic frameworks – to the assimilation of the Gaidhealtachdan into their respective nation states (Macdonald, 2006: 1).

The erosion of MacDonald clan governance in the Western Highlands and Isles occurred, not coincidentally, just as the Scottish reformation was being institutionalized. The result was that for some period of time, an outlawed Catholic Church was simply absent in Scotland. Duncan MacLean indicates that “by 1600, it can safely be assumed, through lack of evidence to the contrary, that not only were there no bishops, but there were few, if any priests left to minister to the needs of the teeming thousands who inhabited those regions” (MacLean, 1952: 6).⁹ Moreover, “the surviving evidence indicates that at least some communities drifted into a state of semi-paganism while retaining a modicum of Catholic traditions” (Macdonald, 2006: 56). The Jesuits had made some placements in the late sixteenth century, but their activities were largely confined to the north-eastern lowlands due to the language barrier that Gaelic constituted (p. 55). Apart from occasional forays of short duration, the first collective response was the Franciscan Mission to the Highlands in the early 1600s.

⁹ John Campbell makes a similar claim: “The Catholic Church, on the other hand, was unable to replace the old pre-Reformation parish priests as these died out. By the end of the sixteenth century the greater part of Gaelic-speaking Scotland had become a spiritual vacuum” (Campbell, 1964: 108).

As a result of the pressing need for a Catholic ministry in the Western Isles and Highlands, various petitions for help were made, including “petitions from Scottish exiles for help from the Irish Franciscans in Louvain” in 1611 (Harris, 2016: 205). St. Anthony’s College, with a bull of foundation issued only in 1607 (O’Connor, 2010: 281),¹⁰ had quickly become “the intellectual power-house of the Irish in exile” (Roberts, 1998: 64), the “cynosure of Gaelic learning in exile”, so an appeal to the College “was no coincidence” (Macdonald, 2006: 67). St. Anthony’s was founded by Archbishop Florence Conry OFM (1560-1629), who had trained in Salamanca in Spain, initially at the Irish College under Jesuit control. While there, he “developed a comprehensive opposition to the Jesuit mission in Ireland and to the Society’s influence in the church in general”, at which point he relocated to the Franciscan College in Salamanca to complete his training. The Salamanca faculty, with whom he studied were involved in contemporary debates, “notably that concerning the nature of the operation of divine grace ... [where] the Dominicans, among others, favoured a rigorist interpretation, [and] the Jesuits tended towards laxism” (O’Connor, 2002: 93). The new college which Conry later founded at Louvain reflected his orientation, and “was pointedly anti-Jesuit and devoted to promoting the training of Franciscans to combat heresy in Ireland” (Casway, 2011: 113). Conry appointed the first faculty at Louvain, Irish Franciscans trained at Salamanca, with a theology consistent with his own attitudes:

Thanks to the Spanish-trained faculty, Irish Franciscan novices in Louvain were introduced to a strict version of Augustine and versed in rigorist pastoral practices, particularly with regard to penance. Conry also cultivated links with the Augustinian tendency in Louvain university, especially that fostered by Cornelius Jansen (1585-1638)” (O’Connor, 2010: 281).¹¹

¹⁰ Casway indicates that “the College was granted a charter on September 21, 1606” (Casway, 2011: 114).

¹¹ The Franciscans, as we shall see, were influential in the proselytization and renewal of Highland Catholicism and, accordingly, in communicating the Augustinian piety which they embraced. This account, therefore, is confronted with Alasdair Roberts’ claim of “a crucially different view of appropriate styles of piety” (1998: 84) between what he sees as the Jansenist Lowland and non-Jansenist Highland styles of piety in Scotland. Roberts’ assessment, however, is dependent on Pierre Chanu’s thesis of a positive relation between

Given such a recent establishment in Louvain, with both limited people and finance, and the compelling need they faced in Ireland itself, the Franciscan seminary in Louvain did not respond corporately to the Scottish petitions for some time.¹² However, John Oglivie, a Scottish Franciscan living at St. Anthony's,¹³ was evidently inspired by the petitions to leave for Scotland in 1612 to gather intelligence and make a reconnaissance. Whatever obstacles there were to a Franciscan corporate endeavour, they were overcome when the pope "personally intervened to guarantee some level of funding" (Harris, 2016: 210). The papal intervention, Harris argues, was enabled by the stabilization of the Scottish state and the containment of Clan Donald, such that "missionary work replaced military resistance as the main avenue for aspirations towards religious toleration" (p. 211). In early 1619, a corporate mission to the Highlands and Islands was established, and three Franciscan missionaries (Brady, McCann, Stuart) were sent to Scotland, soon to be joined by a fourth (Robertson). Protestant persecution led to the capture and imprisonment of McCann in 1620 and Stuart in 1624. In late 1623, papal approval was given to add three more friars to the Franciscan mission (O'Neill, Hegarty, Ward). This first Franciscan mission was conducted between 1619 and 1647. It was followed by a Vincentian mission between 1651 and 1679, and then a second Franciscan mission between 1665 and 1687.

Jansenism and Protestant competition (2003: 113), and the empirical legitimacy of the charges advanced by Father Colin Campbell, the chief complainant in the Scottish 'Jansenist Controversy' of the 1730s and 1740s. Despite some recent support for this view from Brian Halloran (2003) in his study of the Scots College Paris, James F. McMillan (1981, 1982, 1987a, 1987b, 1988, 1993), has, in my view, developed a more adequate explanation of the 'Jansenist Controversy' with his analyses of the Highland resentment of financial inequities and the status ambitions of Campbell. While there are differences between Lowland and Highland piety, the difference is found within the Scots Gaelic 'Old Catholic' culture of the Highlands, no longer present in the Lowlands.

¹² Harris has a detailed discussion of other possible reasons for delay, including his surmise "that the Highlanders and islanders were left hanging while the Irish and the Lowland Scots jostled for prestige and position on the continent" (Harris, 2016: 208). O'Connor, however, confirms that there were "ongoing financial difficulties" in the early years (O'Connor, 2010: 281).

¹³ McNally indicates that John Stuart accompanied Oglivie in 1612, although Stuart is best known for being part of the 1619 missionary effort (McNally, 2012: fn 6, 154). "Stuart reported back in 1614 and after further difficulties (largely financial) two Irish priests, Patrick Brady and Edmund McCann, set out with Stuart in the guise of soldiers to *Montana Scotiae* in 1619" (p. 182).

Scott Spurlock complements this account with a deeper analysis of the role of Clan Donald in the organization of the missions, arguing that “what is crucial for understanding the resurgence of Catholicism in Gaelic-speaking Scotland is that it was not primarily driven by Rome, nor did it reflect models of counter-reformation from elsewhere in Europe” (Spurlock, 2016: 170). Rather, he argues, “at the behest of some clan elites in Scotland, and with their financial provision, a process of confessionalization among clans took place” (p. 171).

A MacDonald role in the ‘engineering’ of the first mission is evidenced by a letter in 1618 “sent from Cardinal Borghese in Rome to the nuncio in Brussels, who at this time was responsible for the affairs of Scotland, asking him to persuade the Irish Franciscans at Louvain to provide some missionaries for Scotland ‘under the guidance of a Scottish laird named MacDonald’” (Spurlock, 2016: 172). This ‘engineering’ went further when the Franciscan mission was later underpinned with a home base for operations in Bonamargy Priory in Antrim, on the north-west coast of Ireland, for which MacDonnell of Antrim provided the main financial support.

Stronger evidence yet is found in Franciscan Brother O’Neill’s ‘reconciliation’ in 1624 of Eoin Muideartach, chief of the MacDonalds of Clanranald from 1619-1670, together with “my wife and brother, with the greater part of our family”,¹⁴ an event which was followed in 1626 with a letter from Muideartach to the Pope. He asked for some practical help – “four ships well fitted for war and sufficient arms for us to equip 7,000 or so of our subjects” (Muideartach letter, Campbell, 1953: 116) – in order to retake Scotland and make it Catholic once again:

If we receive help of this kind we shall easily reduce the whole of Scotland to obedience to the faith of Christ and of your Holiness, nor do we expect any other reward for this (God is our witness) than His glory, the salvation of our souls and freedom from the miserable yoke and intolerable slavery of diabolical heresy ... All the Gaelic-speaking Scots and the greater part of the Irish chieftains joined to us by ties of friendship, from whom we once received the faith (in which we still glory) from whose stock we first sprang, will begin war each in his own

¹⁴ From Iain Muideartach’s letter to Pope Urban VIII, in Campbell (1953: 114).

district to the glory of God (Muideartach letter, Campbell, 1953: 115-116).

Indeed, by 1626, not only the Chief and clansmen of Clanranald, but also “MacLeod of Harris, John Campbell of Cawdor and Archibald Campbell of Barbeck ... Coll Cioltach MacDonald, MacLean of Lochbuie ... the family of the MacDonald laird of Islay (here probably meaning the territories of MacLeod of Harris), with all their subjects and with the inhabitants of the islands of the Hebrides ... Jura, Arran, Uist (Iriod), Canna and Barra (Cintua Barra), had embraced the faith” (Spurlock, 2016: 180). Spurlock goes on to note that the apparent profusion of clans has a Clan Donald core as Muideartach was “connected by marriage with the MacLeods, the MacNeills and the MacLeans of Duart” (p. 180).

In short, the Franciscan mission, and the reconciliation and conversion of the faithful in the Isles and Western Highlands after the Protestant Reformation were anchored by Clan Donald:

Thus there appears to be a ClanDonald backbone to the mission stretching from Antrim to Islay, through Coll Ciotach on Colonsay and to the MacDonalds of Clanranald (spanning from Barra across to Arisaig and Moidart) and Sleat and the MacDonnells of Glengarry (Spurlock, 2016: 180).

The various missions in early seventeenth century Scotland were conducted by the regular orders¹⁵ – for the most part, these were Franciscans, Jesuits, Dominicans, and Vincentians. Perhaps as a result of increased recognition of the mission opportunities in Scotland by Rome, an Apostolic Prefecture¹⁶ for Scotland was established in 1653, with the appointment of William Ballantine.

With the organisation of the Scottish Mission under the Prefect William Ballantyne in 1653, it was at once obvious that Scotland was really two

¹⁵ ‘Regular’ clergy, often abbreviated to ‘regulars’, from *ordo regularis*, refers to those clergy who are subject to a *rule*, being members of a religious order, now referred to as a ‘religious institute’.

¹⁶ An apostolic prefect is a ‘secular’ priest (not a member of a monastic order or religious institute), who operates in a mission territory, not yet a diocese, and in the exercise of his duties has only limited faculties.

very different missionary territories. In the *Gaidhealtachd* there were something in the region of 12,000 Catholics, served by three or four priests. In the Lowlands about 2,000 Catholics were served by only fifteen or so. The shortage of priests throughout Scotland was desperately serious. In the Highlands it was particularly so (MacDonald, 1978: 57).¹⁷

It was almost another forty years before the territory was raised to an Apostolic Vicariate, with the appointment of Thomas Nicholson as Bishop in 1694. "It was under his vigorous and authoritative leadership that boundaries for priests were established in 1701, the ministry in the Highlands and Lowlands was properly linked and the first priest since the Reformation was ordained in Scotland in 1704" (Spurlock, 2013: 244-245). Upon his death, Nicholson was succeeded by Bishop James Gordon in 1718, of the Letterfourie branch of the Gordon clan, which clan anchored Catholicism in the North-East.¹⁸ He began his studies at the University of Louvain, and after four years went for further work at the Scots College at Paris, ordained on his return to Scotland in 1692. As coadjutor before Nicholson's death, Bishop Gordon made several tours of the Gaelic Highlands, where it became clear that "the most pressing need in the Gaelic Church was for indigenous clergy" (MacDonald, 1978: 57). As a result, he established a "minor seminary" in Loch Morar. It collapsed in the aftermath of the 1715 Jacobite Rising, and the Bishop then founded the famous seminary at Scalan, in the Braes of Glenlivet, in 1716.¹⁹ In 1720, a Presbyterian report commented on the role of the seminary:

¹⁷ About a century later, in 1764, the number of Scottish Catholics is put at 33,000, of which 23,000 were in the Highlands; this is relative to a total population of 1.3 million (Toomey, 1991: 4). The increase is, at least, partly due to the fact that "a considerable increase in Highland Catholics early in the [eighteenth] century took place when Jacobite hopes were high" (Roberts, 1998: 86).

¹⁸ "After 1715 the Highland area's Catholic strength was seen to depend very largely on the Clan Ranald MacDonalds and the Gordons. In the Central Highlands (and also the North-east Lowlands) the Dukes of Gordon sheltered Catholic tenants, encouraging them to adhere to the faith which was shared by the ducal house and the exiled Stuart monarchy. The Highland territory of the Gordons stretched from Glenlivet to Lochaber, where it marched with the lands of the Camerons and MacDonalds (Stewart, 1994: 31).

¹⁹ Notably, the General Assembly referred to it as "a famous Popish nursery" (Stewart, 1994: 32).

After study at Scalán and abroad, these young men are returned in orders to Scotland, and by these means the nation is furnished with Priests suited to the genius and Language of every Country; and with Such as have friends and Blood Relations to Countenance and Shelter them (Stewart, 1994: 32).

On the recommendation of Bishop Gordon to the Pope, the Vicariate itself was split into the Lowland and Highland districts in 1727, with Gordon staying on as Bishop for the Lowland district. Hugh MacDonald, son of the MacDonald laird of Morar, which clan anchored Catholicism in the North-West, had been a student at the junior seminary in Morar, and went on to complete his seminary studies at Scalán in 1725, when he was then ordained as priest. Consequent upon the division of the Vicariate, he was consecrated as Bishop of the Highland district in 1731. "At an earlier stage the strongest candidate had appeared to be Colin Campbell", who made the Jansenist accusations a few months later, "but in the end (and leaving personalities on one side) the Clan Ranald connection appears to have been decisive since Gordon described Hugh MacDonald as being 'of a clan the most numerous and which had the greatest weight in the country'" (Stewart, 1994: 36).

This recitation takes us to the period when the migration of Highland Gaels to Nova Scotia began. We have come far afield from our initial discussion of D.J. MacDonald. Yet it should now be recognized that his own family lineage and identity were shaped by the history and practices of a proud clan tradition, one that was transplanted to Eastern Nova Scotia.

Highland settlement consistencies in Eastern Nova Scotia had been constructed on the geography of clan. In particular, Clan Donald, which had borne much of the retribution after Culloden, was the largest contributor to the emigration ... The implicit ghost hiding the relationship between priest and people was that most Catholic Highlanders in Eastern Nova Scotia and Prince Edward island were from branches of Clan Donald (MacInnes, 2014: 110).

And, as should be obvious, D.J. was himself a member of Clan Donald.²⁰

The Celtic Catholicism of Bishop Fraser

Father William Fraser (1779-1851) came out to the Apostolic Vicariate in Nova Scotia in 1822, following “some of his fellow Highlanders who had immigrated to Nova Scotia” (Flemming, 1985). He had been born in Craskie, Glen Cannich, into a large family with ten siblings, to a Catholic father, “kinsman of Lord Lovat Fraser”, and a Presbyterian mother converted to Catholicism before marriage, Jane Chisholm (Johnston, 1955: 113). Lord Lovat Fraser, here, refers to Simon Fraser, 11th Lord Lovat, a chief supporter of the Jacobite cause in 1745, captured near Loch Morar on Clanranald lands, and beheaded at the Tower of London in 1747. Fraser’s father was descended in a parallel lineage from “famous Highland chiefs – The Chisholm and Lochiel” – and was first cousin to Bishops John Chisholm (1752-1814, trained at Douai) and Bishop Aeneas (Angus) Chisholm (1759-1818, trained at Valladolid), appointed in succession as Vicars Apostolic to the Highland District, respectively, for 1791-1814 and 1814-1818. The Chisholms had a long history of fidelity to the Catholic religion, although some individual members moved back and forth between Protestantism and Catholicism, as was true of all the clans. As early as 1579, “Thomas Chisholm, Laird of Stathglass, was summoned before the Court for his adhesion to the ancient creed”, suffering imprisonment for it (Rev. Angus MacKenzie, 1846; quoted in Blundell, 1909: 191-192). William Fraser’s training and his early years of work in Scotland were conducted for the most part under the direction of his Chisholm cousins.

²⁰ The many years which passed between the events I have recounted and the period when D.J. MacDonald was born, raise a question about the continued salience of clan identity in late nineteenth century Antigonish. In an anecdote related in 2001, however, Judge Hugh MacPherson, Gaelic scholar and historian, recounted the scandal which had occurred in the community of St. Andrews, Nova Scotia in 1876 when Angus *Campbell* married Margaret *MacDonald*. Clan identity evidently still held some force at that time (Peter Ludlow, email communication, 06 March, 2017). St. Andrews is located about 9 miles from D.J. MacDonald’s home in Glassburn.

Fraser began attending the Samalaman seminary in Moidart as a boy,²¹ and was sent to the Scot's College in Valladolid, Spain in 1794 at the age of fifteen (Johnston, 1935-36: 23). Fraser remained in studies at Valladolid for ten years and was ordained there in 1804. While at Valladolid, he was noted "for his deep piety, his thorough knowledge of theology and of the classics, and his more than ordinary physical strength" (p. 23). After serving ten years in the parish of Lochaber in Scotland, he was appointed to head the College of Killechiarain at Lismore in 1814, where his interests "as a great linguist and classical scholar" (Johnston, 1960a: 5) could be used. He taught there for eight years before obtaining leave to join several of his brothers and a sister who had already emigrated in 1818.²² He came to Nova Scotia in 1822, therefore, as a mature and capable priest.²³ He served in the Bras d'Or mission, and then was transferred to Antigonish as the existing priest was not able to hear the Gaelic

²¹ The Samalaman seminary was moved to Lismore by Bishop John Chisholm in 1803.

²² "Jean [his sister] and her brothers all urged William to emigrate, as Gaelic-speaking priests were sorely needed in the new land" (MacLean, 1991: 192). It is of some interest to note that his brothers settled at Fraser's Grant, located a couple of miles outside of Heatherton, about halfway to Glassburn where D.J. Macdonald was born. Similarly, it should be noted that D. J. MacDonald's great-grandfather and grandmother came from Kiltarlity, near Beaully, in Inverness-shire (Whidden, 1934: 204-205). Kiltarlity is about 20 miles from Craskie where Bishop Fraser was born. The co-location of both family groups in Scotland and Antigonish is not an accident, but speaks to the bonds of loyalty – what we now inadequately refer to as social capital – which existed in clan society. A few comments about the role of loyalty in the clan system are warranted. Daniel MacInnes argues that "in a clan, collective welfare depended on loyalties to the chief, the clan's allies, and to the King" (MacInnes, 2014: 86-87). He goes on to say that "in the politics of the clan, privilege accorded to the chief was expressed by elaborate genealogies that created a network united by blood" (p. 87), something evident in the elaborate naming systems of the Scots Gaels. "Loyalty was close to the bone. It was a life or death issue. While primarily considered as an exchange between chief and people, when faced with the possibility of starvation, degrees of loyalty separated those who would die and those who would live through a famine" (p. 87). The rebuilding of clan affiliations in Nova Scotia – including co-location – and the bone-deep loyalties which went with that, was not just a convivial exercise, but was a means to survival itself.

²³ "Mature and capable" seems hardly adequate to describe the extent of the commitment needed at that time. John Parker Lawson, writing in 1836, described the circumstances of the Catholic priests in Scotland: "Whatsoever may be the opinion formed of the Romish church, as a system, we hesitate not to say that the poverty and privations to which the clergy of that church dedicate themselves in Scotland is almost incredible, and is hardly surpassed in any country. It is an act of self-denial which, resulting as it must from a strong conviction of the truths of their system, and a romantic attachment to its cause and service, is 'above all Greek, above all Roman fame'" (Lawson, 1836: 299).

confessions of his parishioners. Following the death of Bishop Burke in Halifax in 1820, and a lengthy period of difficulties which Rome had in finding a suitable candidate for the Irish-Catholic congregations of Halifax, Fraser was appointed Bishop and consecrated as Vicar Apostolic of Nova Scotia in 1827 at St. Ninian's, the church he had built in Antigonish. The vicariate was comprised of all of mainland Nova Scotia, with the addition of Cape Breton in 1830 and Bermuda in 1836.

In 1831, Bishop Fraser estimated the Catholic population of the territory to be about 50,000 persons, about 50 percent Scots, mostly in the eastern region, and 10 percent Irish, mostly in the Halifax area (Flemming, 1985). In addition to the geographic concentration of Catholics in eastern Nova Scotia, he had been recruited by Bishop Burke with a view "to take charge of Antigonish, settled by Scottish Highlanders who knew only Gaelic" (Johnston, 1960a: 5). As a result, Fraser decided to remain based in Antigonish "to carry on the active work of a missionary among his Gaelic-speaking people", rather than to relocate to Halifax (p. 5). This base also allowed him to continue the Latin school he had started in Antigonish which he was using to prepare native Nova Scotia sons to enter seminary.

Tensions concerning governance, however, developed with the Irish Catholics in Halifax,²⁴ and Rome attempted to resolve these by raising the Vicariate to a Diocese in 1842 and appointing an Irish Co-Adjutor, Bishop William Walsh, with residence in Halifax. The Roman decision was made, Cardinal Fransoni assured Bishop Fraser, at least in part on the advice of Father Colin MacKinnon, pastor at St. Andrew's near Antigonish, the first Nova Scotia-born seminarian of Bishop Fraser's to return as a priest, and someone "who had always been a warm friend and supporter of his bishop" (Johnston, 1935-36: 28-29).²⁵ Continuing tensions, however, led two years later to the splitting of the diocese in 1844, Walsh becoming Bishop of the Halifax diocese and Fraser becoming Bishop of the Arichat diocese (renamed Antigonish diocese in 1886).

²⁴ Several reasons for these tensions have been advanced, including restrictions on mixed marriages, the needs of the growing Irish political and merchant class in Halifax, and troubles with parish administration.

²⁵ "In a letter dated 19 Oct. 1840 a similar recommendation was made by Father Vincent de Paul [Merle], superior of the Trappists in Nova Scotia and a friend of Fraser's" (Flemming, 1985).

Much ink has been spilled over the relations between Irish and Scottish Catholicism during these years, but it has largely focussed on the narrative that can be developed from the papers in the various Vatican and Church archives. Peter Ludlow (2015a) has recently attempted to go beyond this narrative with a larger story of ethnic conflict. I want to extend this larger narrative by looking at the conflict as one between ecclesial regimes – between the Scots Gaelic ‘Old Catholic’ culture of Fraser’s Antigonish and the Hiberno-Roman formalist culture of Bishop Walsh and later Bishop Cameron.

In an earlier paper on Catholic political theory, I discussed the tension between the commitment to ‘immutable reality’ and ‘a better appreciation’, and discussed how it had been expressed in the church in different movements, alternatively pressing for the exercise of papal authority or clamorously demanding reform.. In the previous section of this paper, I described a Scots Gaelic ‘Old Catholic’ culture that was pre-Tridentine in ecclesiology, clan-based in organization, and infused with a Jansenist devotional piety. The task of this section is to show how this Celtic Catholic imaginary was transmitted to Nova Scotia.

Angus Anthony Johnston, the former Diocesan Historian for Antigonish, has provided the most comprehensive account of the early Catholic church in eastern Nova Scotia. In several articles and with his magisterial two volume history, *A History of the Catholic Church in Eastern Nova Scotia*, Johnston provides sufficient biographical information and historical context for a good picture of the evolution of the church from its pre-history in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, through Bishop William Fraser’s governance (1827-1851), until the end of the term of Bishop Colin MacKinnon (1851-1877).²⁶ R.A. MacLean’s book, *Bishop John Cameron: Piety and Politics*, takes the history forward through Cameron’s governance from 1877 to 1910, and Peter Ludlow’s book, *The Canny Scot: Archbishop James Morrison of Antigonish*, does the same for Morrison’s governance from 1912 to 1950.

²⁶ This information is further usefully refined in his posthumous *Antigonish Diocese Priests and Bishops, 1786-1925*. The inclination of Johnston’s work is as much genealogical compilation as historical narrative: the masses of detail he provides, ever more accurate with each successive publication, provide the necessary foundations upon which larger synthetic histories can be developed.

The Scottish population started migrating into eastern Nova Scotia in the late 1700s, mainly composed of Gaelic Highlanders (Bumsted: 1981, 2001). Those who were Catholic largely moved into Cape Breton and the two eastern counties of Mainland Nova Scotia. The Presbyterians settled largely in Central Nova Scotia, particularly in what are now Pictou and Colchester Counties. For the purpose of understanding the Heatherton inheritance of D.J. MacDonald, our 'representative individual', Antigonish Catholicism can be conceptualized as having been organized around two pastoral regimes in the nineteenth century – the Highland Catholic regime of Bishop Fraser in the early and mid-nineteenth century, and the Hiberno-Roman regime of Bishop Cameron in the late nineteenth century, with the period of Bishop MacKinnon's rule acting as a transition from one to the other. This taxonomy of regimes is closely mapped to the birthplace and training of the priests who were active in the diocese.

"Lowlanders tended to migrate alone rather than in the larger families and/or communities the Highlanders preferred", with a "tendency to go to the United States" (Bumsted, 1981: 70), unlike the Highlanders who were more intent on preserving their traditional way of life:

The Highlanders were sensible enough to recognize that the more populated and organized jurisdictions of the New World would not encourage the maintenance of the old ways ... And in the wilderness regions of the Maritimes they managed to replicate most of the features of the pastoral and independent existence they had long enjoyed (Bumsted, 1981: 85).²⁷

Such family groupings, and the clan ensembles of chain migration, were a lubricant to attract priests from the Home country with whom they were attached. It is no surprise, then, that a good many Scottish priests did, in fact, emigrate to the Antigonish region during the last quarter of the eighteenth century and the first half of the nineteenth, of whom the most prominent was William Fraser. As the social infrastructure strengthened and church institutional structures were established, seminaries for training local priests were built and native Nova Scotian sons began to serve the Antigonish diocese. During the transition period, between the

²⁷ The similarities of geography and topography between Scotland and Cape Breton were undoubtedly a factor as well.

Scottish priests who “came out” with their congregations, and those native Nova Scotian priests who were trained in Canada, various priests of Irish, French, German, Dutch and Belgian extraction served in Antigonish parishes. A total of fifteen Scottish priests served in the Antigonish diocese up until the year D.J. MacDonald was born (see Table 1 below).²⁸

We can gain a picture of the religious imaginary of the priests through some knowledge of the seminaries where they did their training. Given the perilous state of the Catholic Church in Scotland, the small colleges which existed in Scotland during the eighteenth century, perhaps most notably Scaln (Geddes, 1963; Watts, 1999), functioned in the main as junior seminaries (Anderson, 1963: 90; Prunier, 2013: 125). Seminary training for Scottish boys was, for the most part, done on the Continent in

Table 1: Scots-born Priests in Antigonish District		
Priest	Seminary	Antigonish
James MacDonald (1736-1785)	Rome (1754-1765)	1772-1785
James Hugh MacDonald II (1745-1807)	Paris (17xx-1770)	1791-1798
Angus B. MacEachern (1759-1835)	Valladolid (1777-1787)	1791-1821
Alexander MacDonald (1753-1816)	Valladolid (1770-1777)	1802-1816
Uisdean MacDonald (1744-1807)	Rome (1757-1769)	1803-1807
Alexander MacDonell (1782-1841)	Lismore (1803-1808)	1811-1841
William Chisholm (1779-1818)	Valladolid (1803-1808)	1817-1818
Colin P. Grant (1784-1839)	Lismore (18xx-1808)	1818-1830
William Fraser (1779-1851)	Valladolid (1794-1804)	1822-1851
Alex (Mor) MacDonald (1801-1865)	Valladolid (1816-1822)	1842-1865
Angus MacDonald (xxxx-1889)	Valladolid (1816-1822)	1843-1845
Alexander MacSween (1803-1870)	Valladolid (1820-1827)	1844-1870
Angus Gillis (1807-1851)	Valladolid (1826-1837)	1846-1851
Alexander MacRae (1821-1856)	Valladolid (1838-1844)	1853-1856
Allan MacLean (1804-1877)	Valladolid (1826-1836)	1854-1877
Sources: Johnston (1955, 1971, 1994)		

²⁸ Three other priests – John Chisholm (1800-1834), John Vincent MacDonell (1818-1888), and John MacDougall (1825-1891) – were born in Scotland, but were brought with their families to Nova Scotia as children and raised there, later attending seminary in either Quebec or Antigonish.

one or other of several 'Scots Colleges' which had been created in Flanders, Paris, Rome and Spain. Of the fifteen Scots priests who came to Nova Scotia, ten were trained at the Scots College, Valladolid, Spain; two were trained at Lismore in the Highlands of Scotland, two were trained at the Scots College, Rome; and one was trained at the Scots College, Paris. In a previous paper, I discussed the tension between the Jesuit's unitary vision of authority and the Jansenist pluralist vision of authority, the Jesuits with a strong base in Rome, and the Jansenists, with a growing base in the Lowlands, France, and Spain. It is this fact which has some salience for the Valladolid training of the majority of the Scottish priests.

I want to explore this religious imaginary, therefore, through an examination of the Scots College in Valladolid. The Scots College in Spain was initially founded in Madrid in 1627 by Hugh Semple, "with the stipulation that the college be administered by Jesuits" (Kilburn, 2004). Following the expulsion of the Jesuits from Spain in 1767, however, there was a need to act swiftly to maintain the property and operations in Spain, and John Geddes (1735-1799), a trusted Lowland priest, was given the task.

Geddes was trained at the Scots College in Rome (1750-1759), but happened to do so during the papacy of Benedict XIV (1740-1758), who gained a reputation as the philosopher-pope: "Benedict was as near as a *philosophe* ever came to the throne of St. Peter" (Goldie, 1992: 286). In addition, the Rector of the Scots College in Rome was an Italian Jesuit, Lorenzo Alticozzi, "an enlightened and capable man, especially when compared with some of his predecessors and successors" (Taylor, 1971: 50), perhaps complementing "the exceptional common sense and moderation" (Rosa, 2014: 44) of Benedict. Marion Rosa notes that Benedict was "greatly committed to the control of ecclesiastical institutions, the training and customs of the clergy, and the spiritual growth of the laity", viz: the restoration of simpler, more crucicentrist forms of liturgy and devotion; the establishment or improvement of educational institutions – the expansion of the Vatican library, the founding of academies and museums, and a reduction of book censorship; the opening of an "ongoing dialogue with Jansenism"; and the appointment of an Apostolic Investigator into the Portuguese Jesuits, which led under Clement XIV to suppressing and abolishing the Society (Rosa, 2014).

In fact, though, some resolution to the Jesuit-Jansenist division over a theology of grace – the mutual criticisms of laxism and rigorism existing throughout Europe - was a pre-requisite to any genuine opening. The opening of a dialogue with Jansenism, therefore, was the critical step needed for the whole enterprise of reform undertaken by Benedict. As Mark Goldie indicates, it was just this step towards a theological resolution which Benedict took:

Benedict was appalled at the continued diversion of Catholic intellectual energy into quarrels over Unigenitus, the Bull of 1713 which condemned Jansenism. He helped cure Catholicism of two centuries of argument over the theology of grace, pronouncing that ‘on the question of grace the opinions of the Dominicans, the Augustinians and the Jesuits are all tolerated’ ... Meanwhile, in Naples, Alphonse Liguori [named a ‘Doctor’ of the Church in 1871] was fashioning a theological compromise, a restitution of the Thomist middle way on grace, which would become canonical in modern Catholicism” (Goldie, 1992: 288).

Unfortunately, this opening to reform was not carried forward by Benedict’s successor and, on that turning away, much of the trajectory of Catholicism in the nineteenth century followed. What is important, here, is that John Geddes was shaped during that brief ‘shining night’ of Benedicts’ papacy.²⁹

Following his ordination in Rome in 1759, Geddes was posted to the Shenval mission, “where he lived alongside the Jacobite Vicar Apostolic of the Highland district, Hugh MacDonald” (Kilburn, 2004). In 1762, he was appointed to the seminary at Scalán which had fallen into a low state. In the next five years, he renewed the sub-lease on the land, built a new and larger stone building, and attracted a considerable group of new students. With that experience in hand, he accepted the mission in Valladolid and left for Spain, arriving in 1770. After a lengthy period of relationship-building³⁰ and negotiation with the Spanish Court, Geddes

²⁹ “There can be no doubt of Benedict’s deep influence on their [Hay and Geddes] later intellectual and pastoral preoccupations ... At every turn the stamp of Benedict was upon Hay and Geddes” (Goldie, 1992: 285-291).

³⁰ The relationship building was extensive and durable. In 1777, for instance, just a little over one year from its publication, Geddes translated part of Adam Smith’s *Wealth of*

was able to acquire a suitable set of buildings at Valladolid, formerly a Jesuit College, obtain a royal charter, and establish the educational philosophy and instructional program of the new Scots College as its first rector. Kilburn summarizes Geddes' stewardship:

He was a controversial rector, allowing his students greater freedom to mingle with each other and with townspeople than the Scottish bishops thought proper, but his friendships with local administrators and Scottish businessmen in Spain helped integrate Valladolid into the intellectual and economic geography of Scottish and Spanish religious life" (Kilburn, 2004).

A previous paper outlined the cultural Jansenism which developed in Spain during the second half of the eighteenth century. This fitted nicely with Geddes' own training under the expansive papacy of Benedict XIV. It made for a practical and non-dogmatic ideology for the Valladolid seminary, and formed students in a devotional piety focussed on contrition and redeeming grace, rather than ritual form and ceremony.

Geddes remained in that position until appointed Coadjutor Vicar Apostolic and Bishop in the Lowland District of Scotland, returning to Edinburgh in 1781. Geddes' continuing influence was already established, however, with the succeeding rectors. Alexander Cameron, Valladolid Rector 1781-1798, was taught by Geddes at Scalán College in Glenlivet, and succeeded Geddes as Co-Adjutor Vicar Apostolic of the Lowland District in 1797 (Cooper, 2004). John Gordon, Valladolid Rector 1799-1810, was also taught by Geddes at Scalán College, and, after his appointment to Valladolid, remained in the office of Rector until his death. Alexander Cameron (II), Valladolid Rector 1810-1833, a nephew of Bishop Alexander Cameron, studied initially at Scalán, and then went to Valladolid as a student, for a time under Geddes. As far as the Scottish priestly core of Bishop Fraser's regime, all of those who studied at Valladolid did so under one of the Rectors just identified.³¹ The influence

Nations at the request of Pedro Campomanes, then a leading Spanish statesman and a patron of the Scots College. A few years later, in 1885, Rector Alexander Cameron forwarded a copy of, what must have been, the third edition of *Wealth of Nations* to Campomanes as a gift from Adam Smith himself (Schwartz, 2001: 118-121).

³¹ Father Allan MacLean and Father Angus Gillis did the majority of their training under Alexander Cameron (II), but the last few years under Rector John Cameron (1833-1873).

of John Geddes is measured, though, not in these relations and years of influence, but in terms of his vision and personality, “without exception the most charming personality among the post-Reformation Catholic clergy of Scotland” (McRoberts, 1955: 46), someone about whom Robbie Burns wrote “the first (best) cleric character I ever saw was a Roman Catholic – a Popish bishop, Geddes” (Burns quoted in Goldie, 1994: 82; also McRoberts, 1955: 46).

With Geddes, we find an intelligent and gracious man who had the requisite philosophical training, charisma and skills to institute a program of education at Valladolid that would set the tone for Bishop Fraser’s regime in Nova Scotia. Contrary to the ‘backwoods’ characterization of Fraser by Bishop Walsh in Halifax – the habits of “those of the plainest farmer”, someone who does not “live like a bishop nor perform the duties of a bishop” (Walsh to Tobias Kirby, 1843, Archdiocese of Halifax Archives; quoted in Ludlow, 2014: 5), Fraser was an erudite scholar, but practiced an older Highland Catholicism, leavened with the irenic educational philosophy of Geddes and the cultural Jansenism of late eighteenth century Spain. Joseph Howe provides a commentary on a pleasant social occasion he had in Antigonish, and gives good expression to the flavour of Fraser’s regime:

At the hospitable board of R.N. Henry, Esq., the then Postmaster of Antigonish, I met four men, each differing in training, profession and character, but each in his own time sufficiently remarkable to make his society very attractive. These were Dr. Fraser, who became Catholic Bishop of the Diocese, Dr. McDonald, then in the full enjoyment of a large country practice, the Rev. Thomas Trotter, Presbyterian pastor of the village congregation, and our old friend Sandy McDougall.³² They were all Scotchmen or of Scotch descent, were fast friends and cronies. Each would stand up for his own church or his own snuff-box, but they would all stand up for old Scotland, and fight to prove a thistle more fragrant than a rose. I would have given a trifle to have seen and heard our four old friends once more chaffing each other in Latin, English, Greek and Gaelic. With these four men I remained in terms of intimacy

³² R.N. Henry, then Antigonish postmaster, had a son, W.A. Henry, who became one of the ‘Fathers’ of Confederation; Sandy (Alexander) Macdougall, then a young lawyer, later became Solicitor-General of Nova Scotia.

and friendship while they lived. Nothing impressed me so much as to hear questions of philosophy, of practical or abstract science, or of European politics, discussed in the county of Sydney³³ with the keenest of logic and fullness of information scarcely met with in the capital (Howe, quoted in Johnston, 1960b: 465-466; also quoted in Chisholm, 1935: 295).

Heatherton Stampeders

Tobias Kirby, to whom Bishop Walsh wrote his demeaning remarks about Fraser, was, at that time, Vice-Rector of the Irish College in Rome. He became Rector of the College after Paul Cullen was appointed Archbishop of Armagh (Ireland) and Apostolic Delegate in 1849.³⁴ Kirby was located at one of the communication hubs of the Ultramontane movement in the mid-nineteenth century.³⁵ It was not unusual, then, for Kirby to be the recipient of a lament from J. P. Cooke, a Waterford priest, in 1850:

If you knew all there is to remedy, all the evil there is to check! ... We have not had a conference here since the beginning of the distress, four years now probably - & but *one* retreat all that time & everyone doing & thinking & speaking as it listeth him, & no one to prevent it" (Cook to Tobias, Irish College Archives, quoted in Larkin, 1972: 625).

This lament, however, would be remedied over the next decades, both in Ireland and in Nova Scotia. In the Antigonish region, it showed itself with the struggle between Walsh and Fraser and the resulting division of the diocese, in a transition regime under Bishop Colin MacKinnon, but most spectacularly with the rigid and unbending administration of Bishop John Cameron.

³³ The County of Sydney was renamed as the County of Antigonish in 1863.

³⁴ 'Apostolic Delegate' is a diplomatic representative of the Pope in countries without regular relations with the Holy See.

³⁵ See Barr (2008) for an analysis of Cullen's central role in promoting ultramontanism in the English-speaking world.

Ultramontanism was an expression of the same unitary conception of authority which was so evident in the struggles through the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries between Jesuits and Jansenists. Following the French Revolution – as a result of the “faltering fidelity and submission of many a son, led astray by the phrenzy of recent revolution, and the false liberality of the day, and the desolating philosophism of France”³⁶ – the Jesuit order was re-established with papal approval and the ultramontane movement re-emerged. The Movement steadily gained strength during the Bourbon Restoration, and reached its apotheosis during the papacy of Pius IX with the First Vatican Council doctrine of papal infallibility:

Ultramontanes looked ‘beyond the mountains’ to Rome for leadership and spiritual guidance and welcomed the centralisation of ecclesiastical authority in the papacy. Their manifesto was Joseph de Maistre’s *Du Pape* (1817), which argued that the secular power was inferior to the spiritual power and that the papacy, as the supreme spiritual power, should have the ultimate say in the governance of peoples and nations (McMillan, 2001: 115).

Bishop Colin MacKinnon’s transitional regime (1851-1877) sits somewhat uneasily between the Scots Heather Priests of Bishop Fraser and the Ultramontanism of Bishop Cameron. With aspirations for the priesthood, MacKinnon could only do preparatory studies in Nova Scotia, and was recommended for seminary training by Bishop Fraser, obtaining both PhD and DD degrees at the Urban College in Rome (1829-1837). Returning that summer, it was just one year later that MacKinnon established St. Andrew’s Grammar School at the parish in which he was serving near Antigonish, in what was to be his first educational experiment leading to an eventual seminary in Antigonish. MacKinnon’s appointment as successor to Fraser was promoted by Bishop Walsh a full 14 months before Fraser died (Walsh to Tobias Kirby, 1850, quoted in Ludlow, 2014: 5). He was duly consecrated by Walsh in February, 1852, and three months later, in May, 1852, Walsh was raised to Archbishop of Halifax, “with jurisdiction over the newly formed ecclesiastical province of Nova Scotia” (Flemming, 1972), including, therefore, Antigonish as a suffragan see. The finesse was extended to seminary training. Two years later, MacKinnon founded the St.F.X. seminary in July, 1853. John

³⁶ Meagher, 1853: 12; quoted in Larkin, 1972: 631.

Cameron, who had studied at St. Andrew's Grammar School under MacKinnon and had then gone for seminary training to Urban College (1844-1853) in Rome, was ordained a priest that same month. After one more year of studies to obtain his doctoral degree in theology, Cameron returned to Nova Scotia, where, upon his arrival in the fall of 1854, he was appointed Rector of St.F.X.

It was, however, in the soft innovations in worship and liturgy that the Romanization of Antigonish was constructed (Ludlow, 2014: 5-9):

Marian devotion was advanced by placing the diocese under her patronage on the same day of the Bishop's consecration (Nicholson, 1954: 106), responding no doubt to the 1849 encyclical *Ubi primum* of Pope Pius IX describing Mary as a Mediatrix of salvation;

- Clergy discipline was tightened and enforced, communicated at a diocesan synod in 1854, and pastoral letters were issued on "everything from doctrine to church music";
- Regular and frequent communion was demanded of parishioners;
- Paintings, artwork, new missals and breviaries, ornamented vessels, and formal vestments were obtained for parish use;
- A Corpus Christi celebration, in which the Blessed Sacrament is processed through the community, was instituted;
- The language of the local church progressively shifted from the Gaelic vernacular to the common languages of Latin and English.

Perhaps, most importantly, though, was the gradual shift from a parish-centred ministry toward a universalising focus on the episcopacy and papal authority.

The transition of soft innovations which was initiated by Bishop MacKinnon was, throughout his term, tolerated, even embraced, by Antigonish parishioners as a maturation of their religious culture, not as its opponent. And by the second half of his tenure, MacKinnon himself had backed off of some of his early Roman enthusiasm (Ludlow, 2014: 9), perhaps being re-socialized when back among his Gaelic clansmen. This was the world into which D.J. MacDonald was born in 1881.

Such lukewarm Romanism was not the case, though, with the appointment of Bishop Cameron. Under Cameron, the Roman ideology was extended, completed and consolidated. Cameron brought a degree of authority and intransigence to the diocese that simply brooked no opposition. R.A. MacLean notes that Cameron's ten years of training at the Urban College and the friendships he made there, led to "moulding a Catholicism which obediently followed the leadership of Rome" (MacLean, 1991: 9). Cameron's years in Rome were shaped by the civil unrest he witnessed, and his letters home in 1848 and 1849 are filled with his "growing abhorrence of the political turmoil in Rome" (p. 14). It was this experience, MacLean argues, which convinced Cameron of the need for a determined authority to establish and maintain order:

The violence Cameron thus witnessed during his student years in Rome made him a life long enemy to the foes of established authority. It is fair to assume that the dogmatism of Pius IX also held a strong appeal for the young student ... There was no questioning of hierarchical authority in his attitude nor was there any doubt as to the correctness of his beliefs. The rigorous education and training was having the intended results; the formation of a character ready to defend the beliefs of Roman Catholicism (MacLean, 1991: 13, 16).

With the hard-shell ultramontanism of Bishop Cameron, it became evident to both clergy and people that the Highland Catholicism of Bishop Fraser had been abandoned and throughout Cameron's term there was growing resistance. Most well-known, was the resistance of the 'Heatherton Stampeters' to Bishop Cameron's instruction about how to vote in the federal election concerning the Manitoba school question,³⁷ issued from the pulpit in Heatherton in 1896.³⁸

³⁷ The Manitoba school question concerned the conversion of a denominational school system to a public school system.

³⁸ That this was not centrally a political issue is born out by other instances of resistance in the diocese, the most notable of which was the Lismore parish church fiasco, where Bishop Cameron ordered the building of a new church at Bailey's Brook, a distant location from the existing church and cemetery, a decision which met with the ongoing resistance of parishioners. When parishioners refused to attend the new church, "the 'recalcitrants' were denied the sacraments and threatened with excommunication, a tactic that Cameron used all too frequently" (Ludlow, 2015: 39). Dozens of letters over the last six years of Cameron's life detail the imbroglio, involving extensive correspondence from

The feeling against the letter in Heatherton, ten miles east of Antigonish, was so strong that when it was being read at least 40 parishioners walked out of the church. Incensed, the bishop accused the protesters of having insulted the priest by leaving; they countered that they were being coerced into voting for the Conservatives. Cameron denied the protesters the right to the sacraments until they apologized for causing scandal, and it was not until 1900, after the intervention of the apostolic delegate, that the dispute was resolved (MacLean, 1994).

What is of interest for our purposes is that D.J. MacDonald's father was one of the Stampeders who walked out.

~

What I have called the 'Heatherton Inheritance', therefore, is a rather complex amalgam of identities and ideas about Gaelic culture and the Catholic religion in Antigonish. I explored this through a picture of the world into which D.J. MacDonald, our Antigonish Movement 'banker', was born, and explained the use of him as 'representative individual' for this study.

D.J. Macdonald inherited a family lineage which stretched back into the Highlands of Scotland and the resistance of Clan Donald, embedded within a clan system of social affiliation which had been rebuilt in the New World, and part of a Gaelic 'Old Catholic' culture, with a pre-Tridentine ecclesiology and a Jansenist devotional piety, practical and self-reliant in its *oeconomica* of household management and networks of loyalty-bonds. These attributes of the ideal-type – of the representative individual - suggest a culture which had been bypassed by modernity.

parishioners, the bishop, the apostolic delegate, and the cardinal with responsibility. This matter was only settled by Archbishop Morrison in 1913, several years after Cameron's death, when he arranged a consultation with disaffected parishioners and brokered a deal to resolve the impasse, where the old Lismore church was allowed to reopen as a mortuary chapel with its cemetery becoming the primary burial ground, on the provision that all parishioners would attend the new Bailey's Brook church (Ludlow, 2015: 59).

This generation, though, – the generation of D.J. Macdonald, those who led the Antigonish Movement³⁹ – engaged with modernity in a fierce and impassioned way on a great arc of social action. As I have tried to make clear in this paper, though, they did so from a foundation in the nineteenth century culture – ‘the Heatherton Inheritance’ - that they had received. And it is in that sense that the Antigonish Movement can be understood as essentially a movement of resistance.

This paper is a preliminary to understanding the Antigonish Movement as a failed resistance movement.

³⁹ D.J. MacDonald (1881-1948); Jimmy Tompkins (1870-1953); Moses Coady (1882-1959); A.B. MacDonald (1893-1952).

References

- Anderson, Rev. William James. (1963). "General Introduction." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 14, No. 2, 89-92.
- Bannerman, John. (1977). "The Lordship of the Isles." In *Scottish Society in the Fifteenth Century*, Jennifer M. Brown (ed.), pp. 209-240. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Barr, Colin. (2008). "'Imperium in Imperio': Irish Episcopal Imperialism in the Nineteenth Century." *The English Historical Review*: Vol. 123, No. 502, 611-650.
- Blundell, Odo. (1909). *The Catholic Highlands of Scotland*, Vol. 1: The Central Highlands. Edinburgh: Sands & Co.
- Bumsted, J. M. (1981). "Scottish Emigration to the Maritimes 1770-1815: A New Look at an Old Theme." *Acadiensis*: Vol. 10, No. 2, 65-85.
- Bumsted, J. M. (2001). "The Scottish Diaspora: Emigration to British North America, 1763-1815." In *Nation and Province in the First British Empire: Scotland and the Americas, 1600-1800*, Ned C. Landsman (ed.), pp. 127-150. Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press.
- Campbell, John L. (1953). "The Letter Sent by Iain Muideartach, Twelfth Chief of Clanranald, to Pope Urban VIII, in 1626." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 4, No. 2, 110-116.
- Campbell, John L. (1964). "The Catholic Church in the Hebrides, 1560-1760." *The Capuchin Annual*: Vol. 1964, 108-112.
- Case, Holly. (2016). "The 'Social Question', 1820-1920." *Modern Intellectual History*: Vol. 13, No. 3, 747-775.
- Casway, Jarrold. (2011). "Florence Conry, the Flight of the Earls, and Native-Catholic Militancy." *New Hibernia Review*: Vol. 15, No. 3, 111-125.
- Castoriadis, Cornelius. ([1975] 1987). *The Imaginary Institution of Society* (trans. Kathleen Blaney). Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Cathcart, Alison. (2010). "The Statutes of Iona: The Archipelagic Context." *Journal of British Studies*: Vol. 49, No. 1, 4-27.
- Cathcart, Alison. (2014). "A Spent Force?: The Clan Donald in the Aftermath of 1493." In *The Lordship of the Isles*, Richard D. Oram (ed.), pp. 254-270. Leiden: Brill.
- Chernoff, Alex. (2014). "1871 Productivity Differentials and the Decline of the Maritime Manufacturing Sector." *Acadiensis*: Vol. 43, No. 1, 65-88.
- Chisholm, Sir Joseph. (1935). "Hon. Alexander McDougall." *Dalhousie Review*: Vol. 15, No. 3, 293-314.
- Cooper, Thompson. (2004). "Cameron, Alexander (1747-1828)." *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Dardi, Marco. (2005). "Alfred Marshall and Mathematics." Presentation to the European Society for the History of Economic Thought Conference, 9-12 June, 2005, Stirling, Scotland.
- Dawson, Jane. (1998). "The Gaidhealtachd and the Emergence of the Scottish Highlands." In *British Consciousness and Identity: The Making of Britain, 1533-1707*, Brendan Bradshaw and Peter Roberts (eds.), pp. 259-300. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Ellis, Steven G. (1999). "The Collapse of the Gaelic World, 1450-1650." *Irish Historical Studies*: Vol. 31, No. 124, 449-469.
- Flemming, David B. (1972). "MacKinnon, Colin Francis." *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, Vol. 10. Toronto and Quebec City: University of Toronto and Laval University.
- Flemming, David B. (1985). "Fraser, William." *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, Vol. 8. Toronto and Quebec City: University of Toronto and Laval University.
- Geddes, Bishop John. ([1777] 1963). "A Brief Historical Account of the Seminary of Scalan." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 14, No. 2, 93-105.
- Goldie, Mark. (1992). "Common Sense Philosophy and Catholic Theology in the Scottish Enlightenment." *Studies on Voltaire and the Eighteenth Century*: No. 302, 21-320.
- Goldie, Mark. (1994). "Bishop Hay, Bishop Geddes and the Scottish Catholic Enlightenment." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 45, No. 1, 82-86.
- Halloran, Brian M. (2003). *The Scots College Paris, 1603-1792*. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers Ltd.
- Harris, Jason. (2016). "The Irish Franciscan Mission to the Highlands and Islands." In *The Scots in Early Stuart Ireland: Union and Separation in Two Kingdoms*, David Edwards (ed.), with Simon Egan, pp. 203-229. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Johnston, Rev. Angus Anthony. (1935-36). "The Right Reverend William Fraser, Second Vicar Apostolic of Nova Scotia, First Bishop of Halifax and First Bishop of Arichat." *CCHA Report*: Vol. 3, 23.30.
- Johnston, Rev. Angus Anthony. (1955). "A Scottish Bishop in New Scotland: The Right Reverend William Fraser, Second Vicar Apostolic of Nova Scotia, First Bishop of Halifax and First Bishop of Arichat." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 6, No. 2, 107-124.
- Johnston, Rev. Angus Anthony. (1960a). *The First Five Bishops of the Diocese of Antigonish*. Antigonish: Diocese of Antigonish.
- Johnston, Rev. Angus Anthony. (1960b). *A History of the Catholic Church in Eastern Nova Scotia, Volume I – 1611-1827*. Antigonish: St. Francis Xavier University Press.
- Johnston, Rev. Angus Anthony. (1971). *A History of the Catholic Church in Eastern Nova Scotia, Volume II – 1827-1880*. Antigonish: St. Francis Xavier University Press.
- Johnston, Rev. Angus Anthony. (1994). *Antigonish Diocese Priests and Bishops, 1786-1925*, Kathleen MacKenzie (ed.). Antigonish: St. Francis Xavier University.

- Kilburn, Matthew. (2004). "Geddes, John (1735-1799)." *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Larkin, Emmet. (1972). "The Devotional Revolution in Ireland, 1850-75." *The American Historical Review*: Vol. 77, No. 3, 625-652.
- Lawson, John Parker. (1836). *The Roman Catholic Church in Scotland: Its Establishment, Subversion, and Present State*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh Printing and Publishing Company.
- Ludlow, Peter. (2014). "'Pretend Catholics' and Stampeders: The Romanization of the Diocese of Arichat/Antigonish, 1851-1910." Working Paper, Kentville, N.S.
- Ludlow, Peter. (2015a). "'Disturbed by the Irish Howl': Irish and Scottish Catholics in Nova Scotia, 1840-1860." *Historical Studies*: Vol. 81, Occasional Paper, 32-55.
- Ludlow, Peter. (2015b). *The Canny Scot: Archbishop James Morrison of Antigonish*. Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- MacDonald, Daniel J. (1912). *The Radicalism of Shelley and Its Sources*. Doctoral Dissertation. Washington: Catholic University Press.
- MacDonald, Fiona A. (2006). *Missions to the Gaels: Reformation and Counter-Reformation in Ulster and the Highlands and Islands of Scotland*. Edinburgh: John Donald/Birlinn Ltd.
- MacDonald, Roderick. (1978). "The Catholic Gaidhealtachd." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 29, No. 1, 56-72.
- MacDougall, Norman. (2000). "Achilles' Heel? The Earldom of Ross, the Lordship of the Isles, and the Stewart Kings, 1449-1507." In *Alba, Celtic Scotland in the Middle Ages*, Edward J. Cowan and R. Andrew McDonald (eds.), pp. 248-275. East Linton: Tuckwell Press Ltd.
- MacInnes, Daniel. (2014). "The Legacy of 'Heather Priests' in Eastern Canada." In *Keeping the Kirk: Scottish Religion at Home and in the Diaspora*, Daniel MacLeod and Stuart Macdonald (eds.). Guelph: University of Guelph Centre for Scottish Studies.
- MacLean, Very Rev. Duncan Canon. (1952). "Catholicism in the Highlands and Isles, 1560-1680." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 3, No. 1, 5-13.
- MacLean, Raymond A. (1991). *Bishop John Cameron: Piety & Politics*. Antigonish: Casket Printing & Publishing Co.
- McInally, Tom. (2012). *The Sixth Scottish University: The Scottish Colleges Abroad, 1575-1799*. Leiden: Brill.
- McMillan, James F. (1981). "Scottish Catholics and the Jansenist Controversy: The Case Reopened." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 32, No. 1, 22-33.
- McMillan, James F. (1982). "Thomas Innes and the Bull 'Unigenitus'." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 33, No. 1, 23-30.
- McMillan, James F. (1987a). "The Root of All Evil? Money and the Scottish Catholic Mission in the Eighteenth Century." *Studies in Church History*: Vol. 24, 267-282.

- McMillan, James F. (1987b). "Scottish Vicars Apostolic and the Imposition of Anti-Jansenist Formularies in the Eighteenth Century." In *L'Institution et les pouvoirs dans les églises de l'antiquité à nos jours*, B. Vogler (ed.), pp. 407-414. Louvain: Nauwelaerts-RHE.
- McMillan, James F. (1988). "Jansenists and Anti-Jansenists in Eighteenth Century Scotland: The Unigenitus Quarrels on the Scottish Catholic Mission, 1732-1746." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 39, No. 1, 12-45.
- McMillan, James F. (1993). "Jansenism and the Scots College Books in Paris." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 44, No. 1, 73-75.
- McMillan, James F. (2001). "Remaking Catholic Europe: Louis Veuillot and the Ultramontane Project." *Kirchliche Zeitgeschichte*: vol. 14, No. 1, 112-122.
- McRoberts, Rev. David. (1955). "Ambula Coram Deo: The Journal of Bishop for the Year 1790, Part One." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 6, No. 1, 46-68.
- Meagher, Rev. William. (1853). *Notices of the Life and Character of His Grace, Most Rev. Daniel Murray, Late Archbishop of Dublin, As Contained in the Commemorative Oration*. Dublin: Gerald Bellew.
- Mueller, Franz H. ([1963] 1984). *The Church and the Social Question*. Washington: American Enterprise Institute for Public Policy Research.
- Nicholson, Rev. P. J. (1954). "Marian Devotion in the Diocese of Antigonish, Nova Scotia." *CCHA Report*: Vol. 21, 103-108.
- O'Connor, Thomas. (2002). "'Perfidious Machiavellian Friar': Florence Conry's Campaign for a Catholic Restoration in Ireland, 1592-1616." *Seanchas Ardmhacha, Journal of the Armagh Diocesan Historical Society*: Vol. 19, No. 1, 91-105.
- O'Connor, Thomas. (2010). "Irish Franciscan Networks at Home and Abroad, 1607-1640." In *British and Irish Emigrants and Exiles in Europe, 1603-1688*, David Worthington (ed.), pp. 279-295. Leiden: Brill.
- Prunier, Clotilde. (2013). "'Every Time I Receive a Letter from You It Gives Me New Vigour': The Correspondence of the Scalán Masters, 1762-1783." In *Debating the Faith: Religion and Letter Writing in Great Britain, 1550-1800*, A. Dunan-Page and C. Prunier (eds.), pp. 123-135. Dordrecht: Springer.
- Roberts, Alasdair. (1998). "Roman Catholicism in the Highlands." In *The Church in the Highlands*, James Kirk (ed.), pp. 63-88. Edinburgh: Scottish Church History Society.
- Roberts, Alasdair. (2003). "William McIntosh in the West Highlands: Changing the Practice of Religion." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 54, No. 2, 111-141.
- Robbins, Lionel. (1928). "The Representative Firm." *The Economic Journal*: Vol. 38, No. 151, 387-404.
- Rosa, Mario. (2014). "Pope Benedict XIV (1740-1758): The Ambivalent Enlightener." In *Enlightenment and Catholicism in Europe: A Transnational History*, Jeffrey D. Burson and Ulrich L. Lehner (eds.), pp. 41-54. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press.

- Ryrie, Alex. (2006). *The Origins of the Scottish Reformation*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Schwartz, Pedro. (2001). "The *Wealth of Nations* Censored, Early Translations in Spain." In *Contributions to the History of Economic Thought: Essays in Honour of R. D. C. Black*, R. Prendergast and A. E. Murphy (eds.), pp. 118-138. London: Routledge.
- Smith, Val. (2007). "The Survival of the Catholic Church in the Highlands." *Journal of the Sydney Society for Scottish History*: Vol. 11, 1-8.
- Snow, Dean R. (2001). "Scotland's Irish Origins." *Archaeology*: Vol. 54, No. 4, 46-51.
- Spurlock, Scott. (2013). "The Laity and the Structure of the Catholic Church in Early Modern Scotland." *Insular Christianity: Alternative Models of the Church in Britain and Ireland, c.1570-c.1700*, R. Armstrong and T. Ó hAnnracháin (eds.), pp. 231-251. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Spurlock, Scott. (2016). "Confessionalization and Clan Cohesion: Ireland's Contribution to Scottish Catholic Renewal in the Seventeenth Century." In *The Scots in Early Stuart Ireland: Union and Separation in Two Kingdoms*, David Edwards (ed.), with Simon Egan, pp. 169-202. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Stewart, James A. Jr. (1994). "The Clan Ranald and Catholic Missionary Successes, 1715-1745." *The Innes Review*: Vol. 45, No. 1, 29-46.
- Taylor, Maurice. (1971). *The Scots College in Spain*. Valladolid: Real Colegio de Escoceses.
- Toomey, Kathleen. (1991). *Emigration from the Scottish Catholic Bounds, 1770-1810*. Doctoral Dissertation. Edinburgh: University of Edinburgh.
- Watts, John. (1999). *Scalan: The Forbidden College, 1716-1799*. East Linton: Tuckwell Press.
- Whidden, David G. (1934). *The History of the Town of Antigonish*. Antigonish: The Casket.
- Woolf, Alex. (2005). "The Origins and Ancestry of Somerled: Goafraid mac Fergusa and 'The Annals of the Four Masters'." *Mediaeval Scandinavia*: Vol. 15, 199-213.